# List of Correspondences:

- 1) 7/11/19 80 Groups' Original Letter to CSU Chancellor White
- 2) 7/20/19 SFSU President Mahoney's Response to 80 Groups' Original Letter to CSU Chancellor White
- 3) 7/25/19 80 Groups' First Letter Addressed to SFSU President Mahoney
- 4) 8/14/19 SFSU President Mahoney's Second Response to 80 Groups
- 5) 9/3/19 80 Groups' Second Letter to CSU Chancellor White

### 80 Groups' Original Letter to CSU Chancellor White

July 11, 2019

Dear Chancellor White,

We are 80 civil rights, religious and education organizations, deeply concerned about the unlawful use of the name of California State University or any of its campuses to promulgate anti-Zionist propaganda and promote a boycott of Israel.

Many of our organizations wrote to you last year about a hateful, discriminatory and threatening posting that appeared on the official Facebook page of the Arab and Muslim Ethnicities and Diaspora's Program (AMED) in the College of Ethnic Studies at San Francisco State University. That posting, written by AMED's director Professor Rabab Abdulhadi, stated that she considered "welcoming Zionists to campus, equating Jewishness with Zionism, and giving Hillel ownership of campus Jewishness to be a declaration of war against Arabs, Muslims, [and] Palestinians." Although you responded to our groups' letter by affirming that the post was unacceptable and corrective action would be taken, disturbingly, the hateful posting remains on the official AMED Facebook page.

We are writing to you today regarding yet another egregious posting to the AMED Facebook page by its director. On July 3, Prof. Abdulhadi <u>re-posted</u> to the AMED page a message previously shared on her <u>personal</u> Facebook page containing a photograph of a large banner that included the words "Zionism = Racism" and "Boycott! Divest! Sanction!", which was displayed at an anti-Israel rally that she had recently attended. Further postings on Abdulhadi's personal Facebook page make crystal clear that the banner's anti-Zionist, pro-BDS message is one which Abdulhadi whole-heartedly embraces and is eager to promote at SFSU. (See <a href="here">here</a>, <a href="here">here</a>, <a href="here">here</a>, <a href="here">here</a>, <a href="here">here</a>, <a href="here">here</a>).

While Prof. Abdulhadi has the right to express religious, ethnic or political hatred on her personal platform, it is a flagrant breach of academic conduct for her to use her administrative position and the Facebook page bearing her academic unit's logo -- which includes the name "San Francisco State University" — to do so. Moreover, unless the CSU Trustees provided their permission to use the University's name in this way, Abdulhadi's posting appears to be a clear violation of California Education Code section 89005.5, which states:

"All of the following names are the property of the state: California State University...San Francisco State University...No person shall, without the permission of the Trustees of the California State University, use this name...in connection with...propaganda, advertising, or promotional activity of any kind which has for its purpose or any part of its purpose the support, endorsement, advancement...of any...boycott or of any political...movement, activity, or program...Every person violating this section is guilty of a misdemeanor."

Prof. Abdulhadi's flagrant and unlawful conduct requires your immediate attention, and we look forward to hearing how you will address this matter.

#### Sincerely,

Academic Council for Israel

Academic Engagement Network

Alpha Epsilon Pi Fraternity (AEPi)

Alums for Campus Fairness - National

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Davis

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Riverside

Alums for Campus Fairness - UCLA

**AMCHA** Initiative

America Israel Cooperative Enterprise

American Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists

American Council of Trustees and Alumni

American Institute for Jewish Research

American Truth Project

Americans Fighting Antisemitism

Americans for Peace and Tolerance

B'nai B'rith International

Bobcats for Israel at Ohio University

**Boston Israel Action Committee** 

Brandeis Center for Human Rights Under Law

Bulldogs for Israel (Brooklyn College)

California Association of Scholars

Campus Anti-Semitism Task Force of the North Shore

Center for Combating Antisemitism

Christians and Jews United for Israel

Club Z

Coalition for Jewish Values

Committee for Accuracy in Middle East Reporting in America (CAMERA)

**CUFI** on Campus

Davis Faculty for Israel

**Eagles Wings** 

Endowment for Middle East Truth (EMET)

Facts and Logic About the Middle East (FLAME)

Grandchildren of Holocaust Survivors

Hasbara Fellowships

Herut North America, U.S. Division

Institute for Black Solidarity with Israel

Iranian American Jewish Federation

Iranian Jewish Women's Organization

Israel in NYC

Israel Matters

Israel on Campus Coalition

Israel Peace Initiative (IPI)

Israeli-American Civic Action Network

Israeli-American Civic Education Institute

JAM

Jewish American Affairs Committee of Indiana

Jewish War Veterans of the USA

Jews Indigenous to the Middle East and North Africa (JIMENA)

Middle East Forum

Middle East Political and Information Network (MEPIN)

National Christian Leadership Conference for Israel

National Conference on Jewish Affairs

National Council of Young Israel

NCSY

NH4Israel

North Carolina Coalition for Israel

**Proclaiming Justice to the Nations** 

Rabbinical Alliance of America

Rhode Island Coalition for Israel

Russian Jewish Community Foundation

Scholars for Peace in the Middle East

Simon Wiesenthal Center

Slugs for Israel (University of California Santa Cruz)

StandWithUs

StandWithUs Saidoff Legal Department

Stop Anti-Semitism Now

Stop BDS on Campus

Students and Parents Against Campus Anti-Semitism

Students Supporting Israel at Columbia

Students Supporting Israel at Drake University

Students Supporting Israel at San Jose State University

Students Supporting Israel at UCLA

Students Supporting Israel National

Swarthmore Alumni Against Antisemitism on Campus

The Israel Christian Nexus

Tufts Friends of Israel

WoMen Fight Antisemitism

Young Jewish Conservatives

Zionist Organization of America

ZOA's Fuel for Truth

#### Cc: California State University Trustees

California State University General Counsel Andrew Jones

San Francisco State University Outgoing President Leslie Wong

San Francisco State University Incoming President Lynn Mahoney

California Attorney General Xavier Becerra

Senator Connie M. Leyva, Chair California Standing Committee on Education

Assembly Member Jose Medina, Chair California Assembly Higher Education Committee

Senator Ben Allen, Chair Jewish Legislative Caucus

SFSU President Mahoney's Response to 80 Groups' Original Letter to CSU Chancellor White

July 20, 2019

Dear Ms. Rossman-Benjamin,

Thank you for reaching out to me with your concerns. I just concluded my first week on campus and am excited by all the opportunities at San Francisco State and in the region. Creating a welcoming and inclusive campus for our students is a top priority for all of us. I want to assure you that we have implemented a variety of initiatives to ensure a welcoming climate for our Jewish students. These include anti-Semitism awareness trainings; a revision of our policies to ensure that all can exercise their free speech and participate in University activities; the creation of the Division of Equity & Community Inclusion; and ongoing collaboration with SF Hillel and JCRC. I am particularly pleased to announce that we just hired a Jewish Student Life Coordinator to ensure our ongoing commitment to these initiatives and to our Jewish students.

I understand your concerns about the Facebook posts, but please know that sentiments expressed on Facebook pages reflect the opinions of the professor or others who post them. Facebook pages are not officially sanctioned university web pages and do not represent the university's positions or sentiments.

Again, thank you for reaching out to me. I look forward to working with our Jewish students and leaders in the Jewish community to ensure that our students succeed and that San Francisco State be a model of inclusivity.

Be	s	t,
Ly	n	n

### 80 Groups' First Letter Addressed to SFSU President Mahoney

July 25, 2019

#### Dear President Mahoney,

Thank you for your email. Our 80 civil rights, human rights, religious and educational organizations appreciate that in fulfillment of a <u>legal settlement</u> last spring, your university has committed itself to taking forthright steps to address the rampant anti-Zionist harassment of Jewish students on your campus, including by issuing a public statement affirming that "for many Jews, Zionism is an important part of their Jewish identity," as well as by agreeing to independent, outside investigation of all complaints of religious discrimination. We hope that these measures will help to create a healthier campus climate.

However, the recent <u>re-posting</u> by "AMED Studies at SFSU" to its AMED Facebook page of a <u>message</u> from AMED's Director Prof. Rabab Abdulhadi stating "Zionism = Racism" and "Boycott! Divest! Sanction!", along with the continued presence on the AMED Facebook page of a several-months-old <u>posting</u> by "AMED Studies at SFSU," stating that the program's Director considers "welcoming Zionists to campus, equating Jewishness with Zionism, and giving Hillel ownership of campus Jewishness to be a declaration of war against Arabs, Muslims, [and] Palestinians," are cause for grave concern.

As justification for doing nothing about these departmental postings, you have stated that Facebook pages are not officially sanctioned university web pages and do not represent the university's positions or sentiments. But AMED, as an official academic unit of SFSU, and Prof. Abdulhadi, in her capacity as the administrator of that academic unit, certainly do represent the university. The positions and sentiments disseminated by "AMED Studies at SFSU" under the AMED logo, which includes the words "San Francisco State University," must be considered official university positions and sentiments, not unlike those disseminated on the official SFSU Facebook page, which bears the university's official logo with the words "San Francisco State University."

Moreover, as we have written to Chancellor White and copied to CSU General Counsel Jones and California Attorney General Becerra, **these official departmental postings are undoubtedly in violation of the law**. Unless the CSU Trustees have given Abdulhadi permission to use the name of SFSU to promote a boycott of Israel and disseminate anti-Zionist rhetoric, the postings directly violate <u>section 89005.5</u> of the California Education Code:

"All of the following names are the property of the state: California State University...San Francisco State University...No person shall, without the permission of the Trustees of the California State University, use this name...in connection with...propaganda, advertising, or promotional activity of any kind which has for its purpose or any part of its purpose the support, endorsement, advancement...of any...boycott or of any political...movement, activity, or program...Every person violating this section is guilty of a misdemeanor."

**This matter cannot be ignored.** The on-going refusal to address these hateful, discriminatory and illegal postings promulgated by an official SFSU academic unit belies your statement that "creating a

welcoming and inclusive campus for our students is a top priority for all of us," calls into question SFSU's commitment to honoring its obligations under the recent legal settlement, and leaves us deeply concerned for the safety and well-being of Jewish and pro-Israel students, and all students, on your campus.

We look forward to hearing how you will address this issue.

#### Sincerely,

Academic Council for Israel

Academic Engagement Network

Alpha Epsilon Pi Fraternity (AEPi)

Alums for Campus Fairness - National

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Davis

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Riverside

Alums for Campus Fairness - UCLA

**AMCHA** Initiative

America Israel Cooperative Enterprise

American Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists

American Council of Trustees and Alumni

American Institute for Jewish Research

American Truth Project

Americans Fighting Antisemitism

Americans for Peace and Tolerance

B'nai B'rith International

Bobcats for Israel at Ohio University

**Boston Israel Action Committee** 

Brandeis Center for Human Rights Under Law

Bulldogs for Israel (Brooklyn College)

California Association of Scholars

Campus Anti-Semitism Task Force of the North Shore

Center for Combating Antisemitism

Christians and Jews United for Israel

Club Z

Coalition for Jewish Values

Committee for Accuracy in Middle East Reporting in America (CAMERA)

**CUFI** on Campus

Davis Faculty for Israel

Eagles Wings

Endowment for Middle East Truth (EMET)

Facts and Logic About the Middle East (FLAME)

Grandchildren of Holocaust Survivors

Hasbara Fellowships

Herut North America, U.S. Division

Institute for Black Solidarity with Israel

Iranian American Jewish Federation

Iranian Jewish Women's Organization

Israel in NYC

Israel Matters

Israel on Campus Coalition

Israel Peace Initiative (IPI)

Israeli-American Civic Action Network

Israeli-American Civic Education Institute

IAM

Jewish American Affairs Committee of Indiana

Jewish War Veterans of the USA

Jews Indigenous to the Middle East and North Africa (JIMENA)

Middle East Forum

Middle East Political and Information Network (MEPIN)

National Christian Leadership Conference for Israel

National Conference on Jewish Affairs

National Council of Young Israel

**NCSY** 

NH4Israel

North Carolina Coalition for Israel

**Proclaiming Justice to the Nations** 

Rabbinical Alliance of America

Rhode Island Coalition for Israel

Russian Jewish Community Foundation

Scholars for Peace in the Middle East

Simon Wiesenthal Center

Slugs for Israel (University of California Santa Cruz)

StandWithUs

StandWithUs Saidoff Legal Department

Stop Anti-Semitism Now

Stop BDS on Campus

Students and Parents Against Campus Anti-Semitism

Students Supporting Israel at Columbia

Students Supporting Israel at Drake University

Students Supporting Israel at San Jose State University

Students Supporting Israel at UCLA

Students Supporting Israel National

Swarthmore Alumni Against Antisemitism on Campus

The Israel Christian Nexus

Tufts Friends of Israel

WoMen Fight Antisemitism

Young Jewish Conservatives

Zionist Organization of America

ZOA's Fuel for Truth

Cc: Winston & Strawn, LLP

The Lawfare Project, Brooke Goldstein Executive Director

California State University Chancellor Timothy White

California State University Trustees

California State University General Counsel Andrew Jones

California Attorney General Xavier Becerra
Senator Connie M. Leyva, Chair California Standing Committee on Education
Assembly Member Jose Medina, Chair California Assembly Higher Education Committee
Senator Ben Allen, Chair Jewish Legislative Caucus

## SFSU President Mahoney's Second Response to 80 Groups

August 14, 2019

Dear Ms. Rossman-Benjamin,

Since I last emailed you, the university has continued to work on ensuring a welcoming campus, strengthening its support for Jewish students, and reviewing policies related to social media. I assure you again of our strong support for Jewish students.

As I said in my earlier email, this site is not an officially sanctioned university website. It reflects only the views of those who post on it. When the academic year reconvenes later this month, the university's Senate will review policy options that may include requiring that sites use a disclaimer affirming that the views expressed are not those of the university.

Again, please be assured of my commitment to a welcoming and inclusive campus that supports our Jewish students and all students.

Sincerely, Lynn Mahoney

### 80 Groups' Second Letter to CSU Chancellor White

September 3, 2019

Dear Chancellor White and General Counsel Jones,

Last month our 80 organizations asked SFSU President Mahoney to uphold her university's obligations under a recent <u>legal settlement</u> by addressing the hate-filled on-line postings of an SFSU academic unit that appears to clearly violate California Education Code <u>89005.5</u>. (Please see our <u>letter</u>). In subsequent communications that we received from President Mahoney, we were pleased to learn of the university's recent efforts to create a welcoming campus climate for Jewish students, as well as steps the university's Senate will soon be taking to review social media policies. However, we remain deeply concerned that an <u>image</u> from AMED Director Abdulhadi <u>stating</u> "Zionism = Racism" and "Boycott! Divest! Sanction!", as well as the program's <u>re-posting</u> of Abdulhadi's statement declaring "welcoming Zionists to campus...to be a declaration of war against Arabs, Muslims, [and] Palestinians," remain visible on AMED at SFSU's Facebook page.

So too, now, is a recent AMED at SFSU posting that links readers to the website "SupportProfAbdulhadi.org" and includes a request for readers to "Support and Donate to our legal fund: <a href="launchgood.com/supportRabab">launchgood.com/supportRabab</a>," which links to a <a href="webpage">webpage</a> explaining that the money being solicited from readers is to be used to fight "the Israel Lobby" and to pay for Prof. Abdulhadi's lawsuits against SFSU. Like the other two AMED at SFSU postings, this one, too, apparently violates California law: CA Government Code section <a href="8314">8314</a> states that it is unlawful for any state employee to use public resources for personal gain.

When we raised our serious concerns about the apparent illegality of the postings with SFSU, the response was that the AMED Facebook page is a private page unaffiliated with the university. That response is completely insufficient. The official AMED logo and "San Francisco State University" are displayed front and center for all to see. Furthermore, a suggested university disclaimer that the views of the site "are not those of the university" will not address the continued blatant misuse of an SFSU program's logo and the name of the university. An SFSU academic program should never be allowed to use its departmental logo and the name "San Francisco State University" to disseminate politically-motivated and hate-filled messages.

It is important to point out that we are **not** calling for you to shut down the AMED at SFSU Facebook page or to suppress Professor Abdulhadi's speech as a private individual. Indeed, she is free to engage in whatever forms of speech she likes on her own private social media accounts. However, Professor Abdulhadi and the program she directs continue to use official university channels to disseminate highly offensive materials and to engage in activities that appear to violate at least two California state laws. The longer these illegal, venomous postings bearing the imprimatur of an academic program and the name of "San Francisco State University" are permitted by President Mahoney and your own administration to remain online, and university faculty are allowed to flagrantly misuse the name and resources of the university, the more deeply concerned we become for the safety and well-being of Jewish students, and all students, at SFSU.

Since, to date, SFSU has been unwilling to acknowledge and address this very serious matter, we are turning to you. Do you consider the three AMED at SFSU postings we have cited to be violations of California state law? If so, please let us know how you intend to address this matter. If not, please explain to us why these three postings, which seem to be egregious violations of both the law and the public trust, are not being addressed by your administration.

Thank you for your consideration,

Academic Council for Israel

Academic Engagement Network

Alpha Epsilon Pi Fraternity (AEPi)

Alums for Campus Fairness - National

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Davis

Alums for Campus Fairness - UC Riverside

Alums for Campus Fairness - UCLA

**AMCHA** Initiative

America Israel Cooperative Enterprise

American Association of Jewish Lawyers and Jurists

American Council of Trustees and Alumni

American Institute for Jewish Research

American Truth Project

Americans Fighting Antisemitism

Americans for Peace and Tolerance

B'nai B'rith International

Bobcats for Israel at Ohio University

**Boston Israel Action Committee** 

Brandeis Center for Human Rights Under Law

Bulldogs for Israel (Brooklyn College)

California Association of Scholars

Campus Anti-Semitism Task Force of the North Shore

Center for Combating Antisemitism

Christians and Jews United for Israel

Club Z

Coalition for Jewish Values

Committee for Accuracy in Middle East Reporting in America (CAMERA)

**CUFI** on Campus

Davis Faculty for Israel

**Eagles Wings** 

Endowment for Middle East Truth (EMET)

Facts and Logic About the Middle East (FLAME)

**Grandchildren of Holocaust Survivors** 

Hasbara Fellowships

Herut North America, U.S. Division

Institute for Black Solidarity with Israel

Iranian American Jewish Federation

Iranian Jewish Women's Organization

Israel in NYC

Israel Matters

Israel on Campus Coalition

Israel Peace Initiative (IPI)

Israeli-American Civic Action Network

Israeli-American Civic Education Institute

JAM

Jewish American Affairs Committee of Indiana

Jewish War Veterans of the USA

Jews Indigenous to the Middle East and North Africa (JIMENA)

Middle East Forum

Middle East Political and Information Network (MEPIN)

National Christian Leadership Conference for Israel

National Conference on Jewish Affairs

National Council of Young Israel

**NCSY** 

NH4Israel

North Carolina Coalition for Israel

**Proclaiming Justice to the Nations** 

Rabbinical Alliance of America

Rhode Island Coalition for Israel

Russian Jewish Community Foundation

Scholars for Peace in the Middle East

Simon Wiesenthal Center

Slugs for Israel (University of California Santa Cruz)

StandWithUs

StandWithUs Saidoff Legal Department

Stop Anti-Semitism Now

Stop BDS on Campus

Students and Parents Against Campus Anti-Semitism

Students Supporting Israel at Columbia

Students Supporting Israel at Drake University

Students Supporting Israel at San Jose State University

Students Supporting Israel at UCLA

Students Supporting Israel National

Swarthmore Alumni Against Antisemitism on Campus

The Israel Christian Nexus

Tufts Friends of Israel

WoMen Fight Antisemitism

Young Jewish Conservatives

Zionist Organization of America

**ZOA's Fuel for Truth** 

Cc: Winston & Strawn, LLP

The Lawfare Project, Brooke Goldstein Executive Director California State University Chancellor Timothy White

California State University Trustees

California State University General Counsel Andrew Jones

California Attorney General Xavier Becerra

Senator Connie M. Leyva, Chair California Standing Committee on Education Assembly Member Jose Medina, Chair California Assembly Higher Education Committee Senator Ben Allen, Chair Jewish Legislative Caucus